Rightward movement: evidence from Nepali correlatives

Aims: I examine the syntax of correlatives in Nepali and argue against the quantificational analysis in Anderson (2005) and for the movement account similar to Bhatt’s proposal (2003) for Hindi-Urdu. Using a standard set of diagnostics I show that NP-adjoined and left dislocated surface positions of the correlative phrase (CorP) are related by movement. I introduce new data regarding the extraction of CorP from islands into the post-verbal position. Nepali shows the subject-object asymmetry previously unnoticed in the literature. I claim that any approach to post-verbal elements (PVE) that uses rightward movement as an independent operation (Mahajan 1988, Bhatt & Dayal 2007 hence B&D, Manetta 2012) inevitably fails to derive it and should be revised. I offer an account similar in its gist to B&D, but employing only leftward movement. I show that my account successfully derives the asymmetry under discussion as well as scope and wh-properties of PVEs reported in the literature.

Background #1 (correlatives): Simple correlatives are double-headed relative clauses consisting of the CorP and NP comprising the ‘matching’ pair of a relative and a demonstrative pronoun (1).

(1) ma [CorP jun keti-lāi rām-le ̃dek̃-yo] [NP tyo keti-lāi] chin-ch̃-u
1SG REL girl-DAT Ram-ERG see-PST DEM girl-DAT KNOW-PRES-1SG
‘Whichever girl Ram saw, I know that girl’

Two positions of CorP are recognized in the literature: NP- (1) and IP-adjoined (2). One of the main questions in the syntax of correlatives is the derivational history of IP-adjoined CorP. Quantificational analysis (Srivastav/Dayal 1991, 1996) says that two positions of CorP are not related syntactically, CorP can be base-generated in either position and the ‘matching’ pronouns are, essentially, an operator and a bound variable. Movement analysis claims that CorP can only be born together with NP and then it can move to adjoin to IP (Bhatt 2003).

Background #2 (PVE): Three types of approaches to PVEs are found in the literature: rightward scrambling is parallel to leftward scrambling and has no categorical restrictions (Mahajan 1988, Manetta 2012); PVEs are derived as a sequence of a rightward movement of a verb and further remnant VP-movement to the right, all other categories cannot move to the right (Bhatt & Dayal 2007); Indo-Aryan languages are underlyingly SVO and PVEs are derived in the antisymmetric fashion where future PVEs first move leftward from some phrase and then are stranded with the movement of the remnant of this phrase (Mahajan 1997, Simpson & Bhattacharya 2003).

Data: Simple correlatives in Nepali disallow leftward extraction from islands. CorP can move from the NP in the embedded clause to the matrix IP (2), but similar extraction from Complex NP is prohibited (3).

(2) [CorP jun gāi rak̃-ek-i ch̃-a] sitā-lāi soch̃-e [NP tyo keti] sundar ch̃-e
REL girl sing PROG-PART-F.SG AUX-3SG Sitā-DAT think-3SG.F DEM girl beautiful AUX-F.SG
‘The girl who sings, Sita thinks she is beautiful’

(3) * [CorP jun manch̃-e b̃okai ch̃a/t̃i-yo] mai-le [NS rām-le āfno ghar-mā] [NS tyo]
REL man hungry AUX 1SG-ERG Ram-ERG SELF house-LOC DEM
manch̃-e-lāi] k̃ānā di-n ch̃-a b̃anne hallā suñ-ē
man-DAT food give-N AUX-3SG.M COMP rumor hear-1SG
lit. ‘Whichever man was hungry, I’ve heard the rumor that Raam fed this man’

The crucial examples are shown in (4) and (5). CorP can appear in post-verbal position if the ‘matching’ NP is in the island situated in the object position (4), but similar rightward dislocation from the island in the subject position is prohibited (5).

(4) mai-le [NP rām-le [NP tyo keti-lāi] kʰānā di-yo bʰanne hallā] sun-ē [CorP jun keti 1SG-ERG Rām-ERG DEM girl-DAT food give-3SG.M COMP rumor hear-1SG REL girl bʰokai th-ii] hungry AUX-3SG.F

‘I heard the rumor that Raam gave food to the girl who was hungry’

(5) * [NP rām-le [NP tyo keti-lāi] kʰānā di-yo bʰanne katʰā] jʰuto tʰi-yo [CorP jun keti Rām-ERG DEM girl-DAT food give-3SG.M COMP story sad AUX REL girl bʰokai tʰ-ii] hungry AUX-3SG.F

lit. ‘The story that Raam fed the girl was sad, whichever girl was hungry’

Analysis: I propose that in Nepali VP undergoes obligatory leftward movement to a head-initial projection FP located in the IP spine. In addition, V° can optionally move to F°. In this case the remnant VP obligatorily reconstructs from SpecFP to its base position at LF (similar to B&D and after Huang 1993). Note that with the subject there is no remnant movement and hence no reconstruction, the subject-object asymmetry is predicted. The last piece is the escape hatch from the islands. It is provided by the mechanics of Late Adjunction (Lebeaux 1988, Nissenbaum 2000, Ochi 1999). CorP counter-cyclically adjoins to NP in its base position deriving the “escape from an island” configuration in (4). Relevant parts of derivations are shown in (6-7).

(6) No head movement, full VP moves
\[\text{FP} \ldots [\text{VP NP V}] F^\circ [\ldots [\text{VP NP V}]]\]

(7) Head movement, remnant VP moves and reconstructs at LF
\[\text{FP} \ldots [\text{VP NP}] V^\circ - F^\circ [\ldots [\text{VP NP V}^\circ]]\]